#### **Divertor Physics in Tokamaks with 3D Perturbation Fields**

**Oliver Schmitz**<sup>1</sup>, M. Becoulet<sup>7</sup>, P.Cahyna<sup>8</sup>, T.E. Evans<sup>2</sup>, Y.Feng<sup>4</sup>, M.E. Fenstermacher<sup>5</sup>, H. Frerichs<sup>1</sup>, M. Jakubowski<sup>4</sup>, A.Kirschner<sup>1</sup>, R. Laengner<sup>1</sup>, C.L. Lasnier<sup>5</sup>, A.Loarte<sup>9</sup>, R.Nazikian<sup>2</sup>, D. Orlov<sup>3</sup>, H. Reimerdes<sup>6</sup>, D.Reiter<sup>1</sup>, G.Saibene<sup>10</sup>, U. Samm<sup>1</sup>, P.Snyder<sup>2</sup>, H. Stoschus<sup>1</sup>, M. Wade<sup>2</sup> and the DIII-D and TEXTOR Teams

- 1 Forschungszentrum Juelich, IEF4, Assoziation EURATOM-FZJ, TEC, 52428 Juelich, Germany
- 2 General Atomics, PO Box 85608, San Diego, California 92186-5608, USA
- 3 University of California, San Diego, La Jolla, California 92093-0417, USA
- 4 Max-Planck-Institut für Plasmaphysik, Greifswald, Germany
- 5 Lawrence Livermore National Laboratory, Livermore, California, USA
- 6 Columbia University, New York, New York, USA, presntly: CRPP/EFPL, Lausanne, Switzerland
- 7 CEA/IRFM, Cadarache, 13108 St Paul-lez-Durance Cedex, France
- 8 IPP AS CR, Za Slovankou 3, 18200 Prague 8, Czech Republik
- 9 ITER Organization, 13115 St Paul-lez-Durance, France
- 10 Fusion for Energy F4E, Barcelona, Spain

























#### Challenge to exhaust particles and energy















#### **Resonant coupling to self-closing field lines**









## Well aligned external field yields local perturbation









#### Stochastic magnetic edge is formed









#### Stochastic magnetic edge is formed





#### Motivation: ELM suppression by edge resonant magnetic perturbations was demonstrated at DIIID



[T.E.Evans et al. Nature of Physics 2 (2006) 419]



ELMs were suppressed at DIII-D for different edge collisionalities  $v_e^*$  and shapes, in particular ITER similar shape (ISS) at ITER relevant  $v_e^* \sim 0.1$  [T.E.Evans NF 2008]



## Motivation: ELM suppression by edge resonant magnetic perturbations is a worldwide effort





[M. Fenstermacher et al., IAEA FEC 2010, Daejon, Korea]

## Control of ELMs by RMP is envisaged as key functionality for protection of the wall integrity at ITER





Motivation: why are 3D effects relevant in tokamaks? ELM control with RMP



**3D plasma boundary and plasma surface interaction** New state with new features



#### Introduction: Axisymmetry is Assumed to Design the Divertor Components



Simplified Example for Calculation of Deposition Width





#### Mass conservation in open field line region:

$$\frac{\partial}{\partial x} D_{\perp} \frac{\partial n}{\partial x} = \frac{\partial}{\partial z} (n v_{\parallel}).$$

Radial constant diffusion, parallel flow with  $n/ au_{\parallel}$ 

**Exponential decay in SOL** 

$$\implies n(x) = n(0) \exp(-x/\sqrt{D_{\perp}\tau_{\parallel}})$$

Thin deposition width  $\Rightarrow \lambda = \sqrt{D_{\perp} \tau_{\parallel}} \Rightarrow \lambda = \sqrt{\frac{D_{\perp} L}{0.5 c_s}}$ 

Strong symmetry assumptions









 $\Rightarrow$  The separatrix is very sensitive to external and internal perturbation fields







 $\Rightarrow$  The separatrix is very sensitive to external and internal perturbation fields



Typical magnetic perturbation field strengths  $B_r$  applied are  $B_{r, n=3}$ = 4G, i.e.  $B_r/B_T$  = 0.5 x 10<sup>-4</sup>





 $\Rightarrow$  The separatrix is very sensitive to external and internal perturbation fields





Typical magnetic perturbation field strengths  $B_r$  applied are  $B_{r, n=3}$ = 4G, i.e.  $B_r/B_T$  = 0.5 x 10<sup>-4</sup>





Striated, helical divertor fluxes are connected to

Striated heat and particle fluxes are connected to ELM suppression at DIII-D

Weak heat flux filling of lobes

Always clearly seen in particle flux

Geometry: fair agreement with vacuum topology found



ÜLICH



# Poloidal divertor – formation of separatrix sets a boundary for the stochastic system



Perturbed separatrix represents envelope for stochastic interior



ÜLICH



### Perturbed separatrix defines 3D shape of the plasma boundary







H. Frerichs et al. Nuclear Fusion 50 (2010) 034004

Plasma and neutral transport modeling predicts 3D boundary in electron and ion temperature and density fields

## Modeled target particle and heat fluxes follow magnetic footprint pattern



#### **EMC3/EIRENE** modeling results

**D**<sub>1</sub>=0.25 m<sup>2</sup>/s,  $\chi_{\perp}$ =3 **D**<sub>1</sub> **D**<sub>⊥</sub>=0.10 m<sup>2</sup>/s, χ<sub>⊥</sub>=3 **D**<sub>⊥</sub> D<sub>1</sub>=1.0 m<sup>2</sup>/s, χ<sub>1</sub>=3 D<sub>1</sub> heat flux -5 **S** all **C** cm<sup>2</sup> cm^2 / cm^2 ≥ ≥ ≥ particle flux cm^2 -5 **S** cm^2 cm^2 Am Am Am -20 -20 -20 toroidal angle [°] toroidal angle [°] toroidal angle [°]

H. Frerichs et al. Nuclear Fusion 50 (2010) 034004

#### Low diffusive transport required to see striated magnetic footprints

Lobes must be filled by dominant parallel transport along open field lines

#### In ELM controlled H-modes, vacuum modeled lobes define position of heat and particle fluxes onto target

JÜLICH FORSCHUNGSZENTRUM

O. Schmitz et al. PPCF 50 (2008) 124029

[O. Schmitz et al., JNM 415 (2011) 886-893]





#### In ELM controlled H-modes, vacuum modeled lobes define position of heat and particle fluxes onto target



O. Schmitz et al. PPCF 50 (2008) 124029

[O. Schmitz et al., JNM **415** (2011) 886-893]

#### L-mode plasma

#### H-mode plasma



**Proves existence of the separatrix lobes and a 3D plasma boundary** 

However, only indirect information about interior stochastic structure!









3D plasma boundary and plasma surface interaction New state with new features 3D plasma boundary and transport hypothesis Candidate mechanisms for RMP ELM control



#### Electron temperature resonance is a pre-requisite for q<sub>95</sub> resonance of ELM suppression at low v<sub>e</sub>\*



O. Schmitz et al., Phys. Rev. Lett. 103 (2009) 165005 O. Schmitz et al., Nuclear Fusion 52 (2012) 043005



- ELM suppression is not linked to specific pedestal pressure value as peelingballooning stability is determined by complete plasma pressure profile shape
  - Edge current density changes are not addressed yet at all (DIII-D)



#### Potential mechanism for ELM stabilization by RMP





Pedestal height and width determine stability against peeling-ballooning modes and kinetic ballooning modes (local effects)

Local kinetic effects ("Kinetic Ballooning" modes KBM) interact with global modes (P-B modes) on pedestal width scale and determine stability



#### Potential mechanism for ELM stabilization by RMP





#### Candidates for stop mechanism?

- -Open field line layer as new LCFS definition
- -Magnetic island at right location within pedestal



#### Pedestal pressure profiles resemble stochastic layer width at DIII-D and TEXTOR

JÜLICH FORSCHUNGSZENTRUM

O. Schmitz et al., Phys. Rev. Lett. 103 (2009) 165005



Field line connection length L<sub>c</sub> compared to
 (a) Kolmogorov Length L<sub>K</sub> and
 (b) electron mean free path λ<sub>e</sub>

• Stochastic Layer:  $L_c > L_K \sim \lambda_e$  (Y<sub>N</sub>>0.8)



#### Pedestal pressure profiles resemble stochastic layer width at DIII-D and TEXTOR

JÜLICH FORSCHUNGSZENTRUM

O. Schmitz et al., Phys. Rev. Lett. **103** (2009) 165005



Link between exact profile shape and stochastic vs. laminar field line topology?



## DED at TEXTOR as flexible tool to generate highly edge resonant perturbation fields





3 pitch resonant base mode spectra: m/n=12/4, 6/2, 3/1 AC operation: 1,2,5,10 kHz



#### EMC3-Eirene neutral and plasma transport modeling predicts strong poloidal asymmetry



O. Schmitz et al. Nucl. Fusion 48 (2008) 025009

T. Eich et al. Nucl. Fusion 40 (2000) 1757





#### Plasma edge profiles are governed by new balance of radial vs. parallel transport

O. Schmitz et al. Nucl. Fusion 48 (2008) 025009



Short connection length, laminar flux tubes represent helical SOL





#### Plasma edge profiles are governed by new balance of radial vs. parallel transport

O. Schmitz et al. Nucl. Fusion 48 (2008) 025009



A thin, short connection length open field line layer can be an effective limitation of the pedestal width



#### Potential mechanism for ELM stabilization by RMP





Candidates for stop mechanism?

-Open field line layer as new LCFS definition

-Magnetic island at right location within pedestal



Magnetic islands in the plasma edge were identified at TEXTOR in correlation to the vacuum field line tracing





Role as an effective driver of transport during RMP application?

Experimental evidence for edge island inducing enhanced particle transport as a convective cell

















In vessel coil set for ITER



- In vessel coils mounted behind blanket
- 9x3 coils with single power supplies

Coil set with wide spectral flexibility

Toroidal mode number n=3 and n=4 fields seem to be advantageous at the moment



#### Formation of 3D boundary and level of thermal and particle transport is dependent on RMP amplitude



O. Schmitz et al., IAEA FEC 2012, San Diego, USA



Implementation of screening and linear reduction of RMP amplitude have similar impact on plasma edge

High q<sub>95</sub>=4.2 case shows compression of invariant manifolds



#### Heat and particle fluxes are deposited in helical pattern with extension depending on RMP amplitude



O. Schmitz et al., IAEA FEC 2012, San Diego, USA



Implementation of screening and linear reduction of RMP amplitude have similar impact on plasma edge

High q<sub>95</sub>=4.2 case shows compression of invariant manifolds





**Counter streaming flow channels with reduced edge** gradients is potential explanation for pump out



<sup>34</sup> O. Schmitz et al., JNM (2013) at press

#### Counter streaming flow channels with reduced edge gradients is potential explanation for pump out





O. Schmitz et al., JNM (2013) at press

#### Summary and conclusion



- A tokamak is sensitive to internal and external (plasma edge control) sources yielding formation of a 3D plasma boundary
- ♦ Therefore 3D effects have to be taken into account at tokamaks
- The plasma profile shape is affected by the external fields allowing suppression of edge localized modes at DIII-D
- The change of the plasma profile shape induces new heat and particle flux patterns channeled into a helical 3D magnetic geometry
- Striation of heat and particle fluxes modeled provide evidence for 3D
   PSI as a generic topic at ITER during RMP ELM control
- Inclusion of plasma response into modeling ongoing and coupling to ERO as dedicated PSI code is our final goal



#### 2D image of perturbed separatrix was obtained at MAST and DIII-D in visible light images



[A. Kirk et al., Phys. Rev. Letters 108 (2012) 255003]

[E. Nardon et al., JNM 415 (2011) 914-917]



At MAST and NSTX, [J.-W. Ahn et al., NF 50 (2010) lobe structure was found in fair agreement with vacuum magnetic topology



#### At JET, striation is seen in L-mode plasmas only -> indication for plasma screening response in H-mode



[D. Harting et al., Nucl. Fusion 52 (2012) 054009]

[H. W. Müller et al., JNM (2013) at press]



3D boundary formation, i.e. at least 3D shaped separatrix is present on all devices with external (and internal) RMP fields applied

Interaction with plasma response?

Radial transport in 3D boundary and resulting divertor fluxes?

#### **Consequences for ITER with RMP ELM control?**



Actual magnetic topology determines transport characteristic in stochastic edge layer





#### **Stochastic field lines:**

$$\Gamma_{\perp} = -D_{\perp} \nabla n_e$$
$$\nabla n(r) = -\frac{\Gamma_{\perp}^0}{D_{\perp}}$$

Radial diffusion and gradient drive transport

$$D_{\perp} = D_{\perp \, 0} + v_{\parallel} \, D_{fl}$$

$$D_{fl} = \frac{\langle (\Delta r)^2 \rangle}{2 \cdot \Delta l}$$

Enhanced radial transport by field line diffusion causes gradient to decrease



Actual magnetic topology determines transport characteristic in stochastic edge layer





**Stochastic field lines:** 

$$\Gamma_{\perp} = -D_{\perp} \nabla n_e$$
$$\nabla n(r) = -\frac{\Gamma_{\perp}^0}{D_{\perp}}$$

Radial diffusion and gradient drive transport

$$D_{\perp} = D_{\perp 0} + v_{\parallel} D_{fl}$$

$$D_{fl} = \frac{\langle (\Delta r)^2 \rangle}{2 \cdot \Delta l}$$

Enhanced radial transport by field line diffusion causes gradient to decrease



Actual magnetic topology determines transport characteristic in stochastic edge layer





#### "Laminar" field lines:

$$n_e(r) = n_0 \cdot exp \ (-(r - r_0)/\lambda_n)$$

#### SOL like field lines

$$\begin{split} \Gamma_{\perp} &= -D_{\perp} \cdot \frac{dn_e}{dr} \mid_{r=0} = \frac{D_{\perp} n_0}{\lambda_n} \\ \Rightarrow n_0 &= \frac{\Gamma_{\perp}^0 \lambda_n}{D_{\perp}} \end{split}$$

Gradient decay with  $\lambda_n$ 

$$abla n(r) = -rac{\Gamma_{\perp}^0}{D_{\perp}} \cdot exp \left(-(r-r_0)/\lambda_n
ight)$$

Enhanced parallel transport causes gradient increase

An open field line layer can be an effective limitation for pedestal width Note: overlapping separatrix lobes in divertor shape cause small laminar layer and its inward extension is highly q<sub>95</sub> resonant

#### Implementation of screening plasma response does not resolve deviations of EMC3-Eirene from experiment

JÜLICH FORSCHUNGSZENTRUM

H. Frerichs et al. Phys. Of Plasmas 19 (2012) 052057



Excursion of helical lobes is reduced and lobes move back within helical footprint envelope of separatrix



#### Implementation of screening does not resolve deviations of EMC3-Eirene solution from experiment

JÜLICH

H. Frerichs et al. Phys. Of Plasmas 19 (2012) 052057



Target flux profiles trend better with screening response included



Temperature profiles trend better but density pump out is erased

#### Impact of screening on footprint

P. Cahyna et al. Journ. Of Nucl. Mater 415 (2011)





Separatrix structure maintained but interior of helical lobes moves back within separatrix envelope

Radial displacement of field lines from inside separatrix is reduced

#### Impact of screening on footprint

P. Cahyna et al. Journ. Of Nucl. Mater 415 (2011)





Vacuum field

Screened field

- Field line connections to deeper radial positions are cut off by screening layers
- Potential to reduce thermal loss, particle pump out but might increase divertor flux magnitudes

#### Potential mechanism for ELM stabilization by RMP





Reduction of pressure alone only reduces KBM stability, i.e. moves stability boundary to more non-local effects



#### In crease in SOL profile decay length with q<sub>a</sub> while decrease with RMP application and helical SOL formation



O. Schmitz et al. Nucl. Fusion 48 (2008) 025009 O. Schmitz et al. Journ. Of Nucl. Mater 415 (2011) 886



- Without RMP fields, a systematic trend for an increase in  $\lambda_{ne}$  and  $\lambda_{Te}$  decay length with increasing  $q_a$  is measured
- With RMP,  $\lambda_{ne}$  and  $\lambda_{Te}$  decrease with increasing  $q_a$ , suggesting a strong channeling of particle and heat fluxes in well developed helical flux tube All RMP profiles taken in helical SOL of stochastic edge layer



#### Implementation of screening does not resolve deviations of EMC3-Eirene solution from experiment

H. Frerichs et al. submitted to Phys. Of Plasmas (2011)



+ Plasma Response

ÜLICH

Density and temperature fields follow

 $\Box$ 

#### 3D magnetic footprint is induced in n=4 RMP ELM



control setup

O. Schmitz et al. Journ. Of Nucl. Mater 415 (2011) 886



Assessment of 3D edge transport and resulting wall loads and relevance for the resulting erosion/deposition and material migration is important

Main focus so far: standard Q=10 H-mode



 $I_{P}$ =15 MA, B<sub>T</sub>=5.3T with pedestal temperature constrain of 4.5keV



B2-Eirene benchmark was performed to connect to 2D modeling predictions on which ITER design relies on so far (Y. Feng et al., EPS2011)



# Vacuum solution and solution with strong plasma screening was studied a) 1



Poloidal Angle [degree]

Screening of all modes with n=3,6 and m<7 within  $\Psi_N$ <0.96 yields recovery of good flux surfaces

Open field line domain is restricted to plasma edge where field penetration happens including lobe structure

Radial extension of EMC3-Eirene modeling domain was reduced





Non-linear cylindrical MHD modeling with RMHD (CEA) and drift-fluid modeling with ATTEMPT as basis





Cylindrical treatment induces consistency issues for direct implementation in toroidal geometry

Codes in needed which treat the problem in shaped, poloidally diverted geometry self-consistently (JOREK, M3D-C1, NIMROD ...)



#### The DiMES Porous plug injector (PPI) was used to characterize erosion properties in the separatrix lobes





$$Y_{\rm chem}^{\rm C} = \frac{\Gamma_{\rm CH_4, PPI}}{\Gamma_{\rm D^+}} \cdot \frac{\phi_{\rm CD}^{\rm Intrinsic}}{\phi_{\rm CH}^{\rm PPI\, puff}}$$

17

## Measure directly the chemical erosion properties within the 3D boundary

A. McLean et al. Journal Nucl. Mater. **390-391** (2009) 160-163



Local chemical erosion yield is reduced and local CII source decreases within separatrix lobes



- Evidence for decrease of chemical and increase of physical sputtering with separatrix lobes as end point of open field lines from stochastic boundary
- Great data set for validation of combined 3D plasma fluid and surface layer code and investigation of relevance of effects for ITER



#### Potential mechanism for ELM stabilization by RMP





Reduction of pressure alone only reduces KBM stability, i.e. moves stability boundary to more non-local effects

Mechanism to stop cycle from evolution is required with right location in P-B and KBM stability space in terms of pedestal height and width



#### First experimental evidence for stop of ELM cycle by RMP driven reduction of pedestal width



[P. Snyder, .. O. Schmitz,.. et al., Invited Talk, APS-DPP meeting, 2012, Salt Lake City, USA]



Strong q<sub>95</sub> sensitivity of ELM suppression can be caused by resonant manipulation of edge transport and hence details of profile shape



Toroidal average shows significant effect for decay length only for vacuum case at full current level



O. Schmitz et al., JNM (2013) at press

Toroidally localized profiles show striated heat flux with reduced peak heat loads





Toroidal average shows significant effect for decay length only for vacuum case at full current level O. Schmitz et al., JNM (2013) at press



Toroidally localized profiles show striated heat flux with reduced peak heat loads



ISP 30 /2 noRMP vacuum 90kAt Particle flux [kA m<sup>2</sup>] 20 screened vacuum 45 kAt 10 ramp-up 20 40 60 80 100 120 0 OSP. 30 20 10 0 100 60 80 120 20 distance from OSP [cm]



distance from OSP [cm]

**Toroidal averaging requires** rotation of external RMP field



Toroidal average shows significant effect for decay length only for vacuum case at full current level



ISP

120

100

ISP

OSP

ISP

OSP

OSP

120

Toroidally localized profiles show striated heat flux with reduced peak heat loads





O. Schmitz et al., JNM (2013) at press

60

60

distance from OSP [cm]

80

80

100

0

20

20

40

